



THEORIA. Revista de Teoría, Historia y Fundamentos de la Ciencia

ISSN: 0495-4548

ISSN: 2171-679X

theoria@ehu.es

Universidad del País Vasco/Euskal Herriko Unibertsitatea
España

de Paz, María; Ferreirós, José

Guest Editors' Introduction

THEORIA. Revista de Teoría, Historia y Fundamentos
de la Ciencia, vol. 33, no. 2, 2018, May, pp. 267-269

Universidad del País Vasco/Euskal Herriko Unibertsitatea
España

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1387/theoria.19564>

Available in: <https://www.redalyc.org/articulo.oa?id=339755528008>

- How to cite
- Complete issue
- More information about this article
- Journal's webpage in redalyc.org

UNEM [redalyc.org](https://www.redalyc.org)

Scientific Information System Redalyc

Network of Scientific Journals from Latin America and the Caribbean, Spain and
Portugal

Project academic non-profit, developed under the open access initiative

THEORIA

Vol. 33/2 • May 2018

ESTABLISHED IN 1952 BY MIGUEL SÁNCHEZ-MAZAS
Second Series

An International Journal for Theory, History and Foundations of Science



Ὁ Θεὸς ἀριθμεῖται

CALIJ

Centro de Análisis, Lógica e Informática Jurídica (CALIJ)



Universidad
del País Vasco

Euskal Herriko
Unibertsitatea

<http://www.ehu.eus/theoria>

THEORIA

REVISTA DE TEORÍA, HISTORIA Y FUNDAMENTOS DE LA CIENCIA

AN INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR THEORY, HISTORY AND FOUNDATIONS OF SCIENCE

ESTABLISHED in 1952 by MIGUEL SÁNCHEZ-MAZAS Second Series

EDITORIAL BOARD

Editor-in-chief: Andoni IBARRA (University of the Basque Country, UPV/EHU)

Editors: Cristina CORREDOR (Universidad de Valladolid), Antonio DIÉGUEZ (Universidad de Málaga)

Logic and philosophy of logic and mathematics: José Luis ZALABARDO (University College London)

Philosophy of language: Genoveva MARTÍ (ICREA & Universitat de Barcelona)

Philosophy of mind and philosophy of cognitive science: Agustín VICENTE (Ikerbasque & UPV/EHU)

Philosophy of science: José DíEZ (Universitat de Barcelona)

History of science: María Jesús SANTESMASES (CSIC)

Science and Technology Studies: Miguel GARCÍA-SANCHO (University of Edinburgh)

Managing Editor: Mario SANTOS-SOUSA (University College London)

ADVISORY BOARD

Juan José ACERO (Universidad de Granada), Ignazio ANGELELLI (University of Texas at Austin), Manuel ATIENZA (Universitat d'Alacant), Salvador BARBERÀ (Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona), Gustavo BUENO † (Universidad de Oviedo), Nancy CARTWRIGHT (Durham University), Newton C.A. da COSTA (Universidade de São Paulo), Joseph DAUBEN (City University of New York), Elías DíAZ (Universidad Autónoma de Madrid), Javier ECHEVERRÍA (Ikerbasque & UPV/EHU), Josep Maria FONT (Universitat de Barcelona), Manuel GARCÍA-CARPINTERO (Universitat de Barcelona), Manuel GARRIDO † (Universidad Complutense de Madrid), Jaakko HINTIKKA (Boston University), Philip KITCHER (Columbia University), Bruno LATOUR (SCIENCES PO, PARIS), Larry LAUDAN (UNAM), Javier de LORENZO (Universidad de Valladolid), Thomas MORMANN (UPV/EHU), C. Ulises MOULINES (Ludwig-Maxilians-Universität München), Carlos MOYA (Universitat de València), Javier MUGUERZA (UNED), León OLIVE (UNAM), Carlos PARÍS † (Universidad Autónoma de Madrid), Carlos SOLÍS (UNED), Roberto TORRETTI (Universidad de Puerto Rico), Enric TRILLAS (Universidad Politécnica de Madrid), Nicanor URSUA (UPV/EHU), Bas C. van FRAASSEN (San Francisco State University)

EDITORIAL OFFICE

Editorial manager: María Luisa CUTANDA (CALIJ, Donostia-San Sebastián, Spain)

Editorial assistant: Garazi MONTUSCHI (UPV/EHU)

Mailing address: CALIJ-THEORIA, Elhuyar plaza 2, 20018, Donostia-San Sebastián, Spain

Tel.: (+34) 943 017 447. Fax: (+34) 943 015 990. E-mail: editor.theoria@ehu.eus

THEORIA is a four-monthly journal (issues in January, May and September). The contents of this journal are covered, among others, by the following abstracting and indexing services: Arts & Humanities Citation Index®, ISI Alerting Services, Current Contents® / Arts & Humanities, Bulletin Signalétique 519, DICE, ICYT, ISOC and RESH of the Spanish research center CSIC, Mathematical Reviews, Current Mathematical Publications, MathSci, Philosopher's Index, Repertoire bibliographique de la Philosophie, and SCOPUS.

THEORIA

REVISTA DE TEORÍA, HISTORIA Y FUNDAMENTOS DE LA CIENCIA

CONTENTS

Volume 33/2, May 2018, pp. 157-373

ISSN 0495-4548

MONOGRAPHIC SECTION I

<i>Updating indispensabilities: Putnam in memoriam</i> Guest Editor: Mary Leng	159
Mary LENG <i>Guest Editor's Introduction</i>	161
Concha MARTÍNEZ VIDAL <i>Putnam and contemporary fictionalism</i>	165
José Miguel SAGÜILLO <i>Hilary Putnam on the philosophy of logic and mathematics</i>	183
Otávio BUENO <i>Putnam's indispensability argument revisited, reassessed, revived</i>	201
Sorin BANGU <i>Indispensability, causation and explanation</i>	219
Susan VINEBERG <i>Mathematical explanation and indispensability</i>	233
Matteo PLEBANI <i>The indispensability argument and the nature of mathematical objects</i>	249

MONOGRAPHIC SECTION II

<i>From basic cognition to mathematical practice</i> Guest Editors: María de Paz and José Ferreirós	265
María DE PAZ and José FERREIRÓS <i>Guest Editors' Introduction</i>	267
Rafael NÚÑEZ <i>Praxis matemática: reflexiones sobre la cognición que la hace posible</i>	271
Markus PANTSAR <i>Early numerical cognition and mathematical processes</i>	285
Roy WAGNER <i>Cognitive stories and the image of mathematics</i>	305
José FERREIRÓS y Manuel J. GARCÍA-PÉREZ <i>¿«Natural» y «euclidiana»? Reflexiones sobre la geometría práctica y sus raíces cognitivas</i>	325
Valeria GIARDINO <i>Manipulative imagination: how to move things around in mathematics</i>	345
Sorin COSTREIE <i>The geometrical basis of arithmetical knowledge: Frege and Dehaene</i>	361
SUMMARY	371

Guest Editors' Introduction

María DE PAZ and José FERREIRÓS

Received: 09/04/2018

Final versión: 10/04/2018

BIBLID 0495-4548(2018)33:2p.267-269

DOI: 10.1387/theoria.19564

In recent years, much discussion has been devoted to the relations between cognition and mathematical practice, thanks to the work of cognitive scientists, philosophers and historians of mathematics dedicated to this topic. Initially, the investigation focused in particular on the question which 'core' cognitive systems might ground several mathematical notions and results —especially the number concept. More recently it has moved towards discussion of mathematics as a product of embodied cognition, evaluating the role of conceptual metaphors, bodily experience, and external representations in mathematical practice and mathematical understanding.

Some of these proposals claim that mathematics is a unique type of human conceptual system, sustained by specific neural activity and bodily functions, and brought forth via the recruitment of everyday cognitive mechanisms that make human imagination, abstraction, and semiotic processes (work on notations) possible. The question of the nature of mathematics has been addressed as an empirical issue subject to methodological investigations of an interdisciplinary nature, involving hypothesis testing.

At the same time, however, such claims have been received with skepticism, be it that they are considered premature or because their actual links with mathematical knowledge, properly speaking, are found wanting.

This Special Issue addresses the question, what brings us humans from basic cognition to the practice of mathematics, gathering together scholars from different disciplines with the aim to develop common points of view. The focus is, primarily, on what separates mathematics properly speaking from basic cognition, and which cognitive ingredients may act as bridges between both. The idea of the Issue came out of the Workshop "From basic cognition to mathematical practice" (<https://gecomat12.wordpress.com/>) that took place at the Institute of Mathematics of the Universidad de Sevilla (IMUS) in September 2016. However we are not publishing the proceedings of the workshop. The editors have selected some of the most interesting talks and asked their authors to further elaborate on the ideas presented then.

The result, as the reader will find below, is a varied approach to several questions on mathematical practice, mathematical cognition, and specific issues in mathematics. The approach is obviously multidisciplinary, featuring elements from cognitive science, history, philosophy, semiotics, or even archaeology. The topics discussed include cognition of



number, proto-arithmetic, geometric cognition and proto-geometry, but also the concept of infinity, cognition of time, dynamic elements in mathematical concepts, and quite importantly the cognitive role and functioning of semiotic tools. All authors seem to agree on some version of embodied cognition, yet there are big differences as to specific characteristics of the cognitive approach adopted or supported.

Three of the papers bear relations with the cognitive theory of conceptual metaphors, put forward by Lakoff and applied to mathematics jointly with Núñez. Rafael Núñez reflects on the kind of cognition that makes mathematical practice possible. From a multidisciplinary approach which includes linguistics, ethnography, and of course mathematics, he analyses cognitive mechanisms which seem fundamental in the practice of abstracting and imagining. The notion of conceptual metaphor is combined with gesture studies in order to apply it to specific issues such as motion-based representations in mathematics or the conception of time. The second text, by Markus Pantsar, considers numerical cognition in the light of a newly proposed basic metaphor, the Process $\rightarrow$ Object Metaphor, trying to overcome some gaps between experimental research on numerical cognition and arithmetic properly. Roy Wagner proposes a refreshing view in favor of fallibilism in mathematics. Confronting two different cognitive stories (as he refers to them), he considers the image of mathematics emerging from them by contrast with conservative or absolutist views about mathematics.

José Ferreirós and Manuel García-Pérez question recent cognitive approaches, especially by Spelke and collaborators, who identify what they call ‘natural geometry’ with Euclidean geometry, presenting this as ‘the’ universal geometry. They consider several experimental results in cognitive science, together with data from comparative history of science in different cultures and archeological records, in order to discuss the role of material culture in the development of geometry. They present so-called ‘basic geometry’ as significantly different from the Euclidean theoretical framework.

Starting with a semiotic approach to embodied mathematics, Valeria Giardino reflects on the role of notation, formulas or diagrams, as cognitive tools for mathematical practice. She explores a particular theoretical framework to situate the role of these tools: Kendal Walton’s theory of representation as games of make-believe combined with the notion of affordance introduced by James Gibson. Finally, Sorin Costreie presents an original combination of Frege’s late conception of arithmetic as geometrically based with Stanislas Dehaene’s cognitive intuitionism (the “number sense” in its relation with spatial representations), arguing for their compatibility.

It is our belief that all of these papers introduce relevant contributions to important questions about the specificity of mathematical knowledge and its production, cognitive ingredients that mediate between basic cognition and intellectual practices, how innovation becomes possible in mathematics, etc. As editors, we would like to thank the authors and the referees for their good work, and the journal *Theoria* for the availability to publish the issue. Special thanks go to María José García-Encinas for her help and patience in the editorial process.

MARÍA DE PAZ is Assistant Professor at the Department of Logic and Philosophy of Science at the Universidad de Sevilla. She has been a post-doc at the same department, at the Institute of Mathematics of the Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (Brazil), and visiting fellow at the MPIWG Berlin and at the Institut für Philosophie I, Ruhr-Universität Bochum. She co-edited (with R. DiSalle) the volume *Poincaré, philosopher of science*. Her current work is about the interaction between mathematics and mechanics in the 19th century.

ADDRESS: Department of Logic and Philosophy of Science. Facultad de Filosofía, Universidad de Sevilla. C/ Camilo José Cela S/N, 41018 Sevilla (Spain). E-mail: maria.depaz@hotmail.com

JOSÉ FERREIRÓS is Professor of Logic and Philosophy of Science at the Department of Philosophy at the Universidad de Sevilla. He has been Fulbright Fellow at UC Berkeley and is a founding member of the APMP (*Association for Philosophy of Mathematical Practice*) and member of the *Acad. Int. de Philosophie des Sciences*. He has recently published *Mathematical Knowledge and the Interplay of Practices* (Princeton UP, 2015), and *El árbol de los números* (ed. with Abel Lassalle Casanave, Editorial Univ. Sevilla, 2016).

ADDRESS: Departamento de Filosofía y Lógica y Filosofía de la Ciencia. Facultad de Filosofía, Universidad de Sevilla. C/ Camilo José Cela s/n, 41018 Sevilla (Spain). Email: josef@us.es