The objective of this study was to compare students' perceptions with their teachers' judgments of their academic performance. Participants were 474 Argentinean secondary students, attending public and private schools, and their Math and Social Sciences teachers. Each student was placed in one of two groups depending whether their academic performance was high or low (251 and 223 respectively), in function of their teachers' assessment. Content analysis indicated similarities and differences in teachers' judgments which were consistent with the subjects they teach. In their definition of high academic performance, math teachers placed the greatest weight on ability to solving problems, while social sciences teachers on positive school attitudes. Multidimensional analysis revealed that high achievers viewed themselves as motivated, and academically competent, thus reflecting positive academic self-concepts and correspondence with teachers' criteria. On the other hand, students with poor academic performance showed stronger discrepancies with teachers' judgments. The implications of these findings for educational practices are considered.