Gautreaux, Michelle; Delgado, Sandra

Portrait of a Teach for All (TFA) Teacher: Media Narratives of the Universal TFA Teacher in 12 Countries


Arizona State University
Arizona, Estados Unidos

Available in: http://www.redalyc.org/articulo.oa?id=275043450096
Portrait of a *Teach for All* (TFA) Teacher: 
Media Narratives of the Universal TFA Teacher in 12 Countries

Michelle Gautreaux & Sandra Delgado
University of British Columbia
Canada


**Abstract:** This article employs narrative analysis to examine how the media in 12 different countries characterize the *Teach for All* (TFA) teacher. Examining mass media narratives in these 12 countries illustrates that there are some remarkable commonalities in the narratives and character portraits co-constructed and propagated by the media. At the core of these narratives is the notion of a problem in education. This problem justifies the creation and emergence of a character, commonly constructed in opposition to traditionally certified teachers, who embodies the characteristics and attributes of the contemporary neoliberal subject. This article discusses the implications of this character’s widespread representation; namely, how does the character construction influence the broader public perception about education and how is it contributing to the (re)imagination of the role of the teacher?
Keywords: Teach for All; teacher education; media analysis; global corporate education reform; narrative inquiry; character analysis

Retrato del profesor de Teach for All (TFA): Narrativas mediáticas sobre el profesor de TFA en 12 países

Resumen: Este artículo emplea análisis narrativo para examinar como los medios en 12 diferentes países caracterizan el profesor de Teach for All (TFA). Examinando las narrativas de los medios masivos en estos 12 países muestra que existen remarcales similidades en las narrativas y retratos construidos y propagados por los medios sobre los docentes de la organización Teach of All. En el centro de estas narrativas esta la noción de que hay un problema en la educación, y este problema justifica el surgimiento del personaje principal e de la historia. Este personaje es comúnmente construido en oposición a los profesores certificados de formas tradiciones y personifica las características y atributos del sujeto neoliberal contemporáneo. Este documento discute las implicaciones de esta representación del personaje, puntualmente, explora como la construcción del profesor de TFA influye a percepción del público sobre la educación y como contribuye a la (re) imaginación del rol del profesor.

Palabras-clave: Teach for All; educación profesional; análisis de medios; reforma educativa global; investigación narrativa; análisis de personaje

Retrato de uma Teach for All (TFA) professor: Narrativas de mídia do professor TFA universal em 12 países

Resumo: Este artigo usa a análise da narrativa para examinar como os meios de comunicação em 12 países diferentes caracterizam o professo “Teach for All” (TFA). Examinando as narrativas da grande mídia desse 12 países mostra que existem semelhanças notáveis nas narrativas retratos construídos e propagados pelos meios de comunicação sobre o professores que ensinam na organização. No centro dessas narrativas se tem noção de que há um problema na educação, e este problema justifica a ascensão do personagem principal e da história. Este personagem é comumente construído em oposição aos professores tradicionais certificados e personifica as características e atributos do sujeito neoliberal contemporâneo. Este artigo discute as implicações dessa representação do personagem, pontualmente, e explora como a construção do professor de TFA influi a percepção do público sobre educação e como ele contribui para a idealização do papel do professor.

Palavras-chave: Teach for All; educação profissional; análise de mídia; reforma educacional global; pesquisa narrativa; análise de personagem

Setting the Global Context

Global Education Reform

Since the 1980s, there has been a growing global movement to reconceptualize and restructure public education to serve the international need for economic growth, social development, industrialization and economic competition between nations (Au & Ferrare, 2015; Gutstein & Lipman, 2013; Hill & Kumar, 2009; Rizvi & Lingard, 2010). This movement at times has been referred to as the global education reform movement (GERM) (Sahlberg, 2012), or global corporate education reform, where education policies in countries around the world have increasingly embraced market-based approaches that consist of common features such as:
standardization and narrowing of curriculum to emphasize math, science and technology (at the expense of social sciences, philosophy and humanities), the expansion of test-based accountability policies to measure student learning and hold teachers accountable, increased competition among education systems internationally (as educational achievement is assumed to be an indicator of a country’s economic competitiveness), increased school choice (whereby parents and students are positioned as consumers of educational services), borrowing and implementation of corporate management models to improve education and train school leaders, teachers and administrators, and the expansion of fast-track, alternative teacher education programs, to name a few of the most prominent features of the reforms (Au, 2011; Au & Ferrare, 2015; La Londe, Brewer & Lubienski, 2015; Sahlberg, 2012; Saltman, 2014; Steiner-Khamsi, 2016).

The global education reform movement is best conceptualized as an entwined and complex network of governments, international governmental organizations (such as the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development), corporations, think tanks, nonprofits, for-profits, global ‘edu-businesses’, and venture philanthropists who influence and steer national education policies in countries across the world towards embracing market-based reforms (Anderson & Herr, 2015; Apple, 2015; Au & Ferrare, 2015; Ball, 2012; Sondel, Kretchmar & Ferrare, 2015). These reforms, also often referred to as neoliberal education reforms, are premised on the logic of the market whereby individual choice, privatization and the logic of competition are understood as the most efficient policy mechanisms to allocate resources and organize society (Au & Ferrare, 2015; Lipman, 2011; Rizvi & Lingard, 2010). As such, the logic of the private sector is transferred to public services, such as healthcare and education, in what has been called the rise of “new public management” (Anderson & Cohen, 2015). Neoliberal policies have resulted in the state increasingly withdrawing from its social welfare function and instead working to expand the market and create conditions for competition and new private investments in the public sector, to name a few (Ford, Porfillo & Goldstein, 2015; Rizvi & Lingard, 2010; see also, Robertson & Verger, 2012, on the role of public-private partnerships in global education policy trend).

Teach for All and Global Corporate Education Reform

Teach for All plays an important role in global educational policy and governance networks. Founded in 2007 at the Clinton Global Initiative, Teach for All grew out of Teach for America in the US and Teach First in the UK (Straubhaar & Friedrich, 2015). Teach for All is the name for the umbrella network of various social entrepreneurs that adopt the Teach for All model in their particular countries (Straubhaar & Friedrich, 2015). This model rests upon the notion that educational inequality can be reduced by placing graduates from elite universities into schools that are designated as in “high need” (de Marrais, Wenner, & Lewis, 2013; Kavanagh & Dunn, 2013; La Londe, Brewer & Lubienski, 2015). According to Teach for All, teachers are one of the main factors in improving educational systems; good teachers provide students with educational opportunity despite their socioeconomic status (Scott, Trujillo, & Rivera, 2016). Thus, Teach for All's efforts strive towards training and developing ‘transformational’ teachers and leaders as the way to ending educational inequality (La Londe, Brewer & Lubienski, 2015). Teach for All advances an entrepreneurial approach to solving educational inequity and is an example of the push towards the deregulation of teacher education programs globally (Au & Ferrare, 2015; La Londe, Brewer & Lubienski, 2015). Teach for

---

1 Anderson and Cohen (2015) explain the shift toward new public management as follows “in the last four decades there has been a shift from a rule-governed, administrative, bureaucratic management to an outcomes-based, entrepreneurial, corporate model of management.” (p. 3). See the special issue in Education Policy Analysis Archives titled, “New Public Management and the New Professionalism in Education: Compliance, Appropriation and Resistance” from 2015.
All's support for and participation in corporate, market-based approaches to education reform globally can be seen in its “... reliance on the private sector to move teacher and educational policies, its emphasis on creating a movement of individual social entrepreneurs, and its tacit acceptance of the diminished role of the state in ensuring resource equity between schools and across schooling systems” (Scott et al., 2016, p. 4).

It is important to note that although Teach for All has extensive global reach, operating in 39 countries as of 2016, and is part of the global educational policy and governance network advancing corporate reforms in countries around the world, the way the organization’s model is adapted and implemented in different countries varies according to national and local contexts (Scott et al., 2016; Straubhaar & Friedrich, 2015). As Rizvi & Lingard (2010) point out, “... the flows of global ideologies [and policies] always come up against local and national histories, cultures and politics; in a word, such global flows are ‘vernacularized’” (p. 17). Global corporate education reform is articulated and manifest in different ways and through a variety of mechanisms in different countries. In other words, while it is important to place corporate, market-based education reforms and initiatives — such as Teach for All — in their global context, it is also important to understand the unique and nuanced ways in which broader reform policies and efforts play out in local contexts. With regard to Teach for All, the particular local and national contexts in which each TFA chapter operates cannot be overlooked.

Parallel to the discussion of global corporate education reform is the discussion regarding the role of the news media in spreading and gathering support towards different aspects of corporate education reform in various countries around the world. As Cabalin (2016) argues, media has played a central role in “(t)he global circulation of policy ideas and discourses”, which “is a product of an incessant network of information, where the media play a crucial role in the legitimization of neoliberal policies in education” (p. 10). There is a growing body of scholarship that has analyzed how news media covers education, both in the US and globally (see Anderson, 2007; Cabalin, 2016; Cohen, 2010; Goldstein, 2011; Haas, 2007; Saltman, 2016; Stack, 2006; Wubbena, 2016, to name a few). Recent critical scholarship has examined how the mainstream media in various countries influences the public’s perception of teachers, teaching and public schooling, by presenting teachers and teachers’ unions as an impediment to improving education, and actively advances the corporate agenda by presenting market-based reforms and those who support them as solutions to improving “failing” education systems (e.g. Anderson, 2007; Cabalin, 2014, 2016; Cohen, 2010; Gautreaux, 2015; Goldstein, 2011; Keogh & Garrick, 2011; Moses, 2007; Wallace, 1997). While these scholars working within critical perspectives have exposed how mainstream media in countries around the world play a key role in legitimating, reinforcing and propagating the particular worldviews, voices and perspectives led by the corporate education reform supporters, the relationship between media and media audiences requires a deeper and more complex understanding. As Bazalgette (1992) argues, “the assumption that audiences are passive and gullible is fast losing ground to the idea that audiences make meanings from texts, rather than having meanings thrust upon them” (pp. 214-215). In other words, the engagement with the media is not and should not be understood as a unidirectional process whereby audiences just simply receive what is given to them; there are always several cultural, social and personal factors that influence how meanings are negotiated and appropriated by audiences, which allows for diversity in the interpretations of media narratives.
Methodology and Data Collection

In this article, narrative analysis is employed to examine how the media in 12 different countries characterize the Teach for All (TFA) teacher in their accounts. Along with Valentine (2010) and Palfreman (2006), we conceptualize journalists as storytellers whose accounts consist of the key features of narrative and can thus be read and analyzed narratively. Narratives are accounts of events or actions that develop in a sequenced way (Bruner, 1991; Ewick & Silbey, 2003; Gabriel, 2004; Polletta & Chen, 2012; Riessman, 2008). The core components or features of narrative, which are also present in media accounts, include a setting for a story, a series of actions or emplotment, and the characterization of an agent — human or non-human — that acts (Bruner, 1991; Kruck & Spencer, 2013).

The focus of analysis in this paper is on the characterization of the TFA teacher in each of the media narratives collected from the following countries: England, Argentina, Colombia, Panama, Uruguay, Chile, Peru, New Zealand, Australia, Spain, Mexico, and the US. Some narrative scholars argue that analysis of characters deserves specific attention, since both the story and narrative discourse rely on and are influenced by the actions, morals, and behaviors of the character (Yumansky, 2008). For example, Yumansky (2008) argues that “(i)mPLICITLY, boTH stORY ANd nARRATIVE dIscouRSe ARe HOly RELIANT ONStORY AND nARRATIVE dIsCOURSE hIGHLIGHTS THE IMPORtANCE OFTHE ROLe OFSTORY WITHIN STYLMAll fORSTORY (p. 41). Therefore, as part of narrative theory, the analysis of the characterization seeks to examine and understand how personality traits of fictional characters are constructed in stories. This study examines through characterization analysis how the personality and professional teaching traits of the TFA teacher are constructed in the media stories analyzed. This research is guided by three questions:

1. How do the media narratives in the 12 countries describe, portray, or represent the TFA teachers?
2. Do those descriptions, portraits and representations cohere to form a consistent narrative characterization? If so, what are the main points of congruence?
3. What are the wider social implications of this characterization?

This study analyzes articles from major newspapers with national presence and daily circulation in all twelve countries. All of these newspapers have print and online versions. We chose major newspapers for collecting the data as these sources are where most people receive their information regarding most events, both nationally and internationally. To gather the set of articles, we used the local google news search engine for each of the countries, (e.g. google.com.co for Colombian specific pages, google.co.uk for UK-based pages). We typed the name of the TFA chapter for each country (e.g. In google.com.co we typed “Enseña por Colombia”, in google.co.uk we typed “Teach First”), then we selected the “news” tab, filtered the search for relevance, and included the archived articles in our search.

To assure the relevance of the news source selected in each country context, we checked with the website newspaperindex (http://www.newspaperindex.com/) to confirm that the newspapers we included in the data set were also part of the list. We restricted ourselves to written news and analyzed only articles that were part of the main reporting of the newspaper, excluding op-eds, opinion columns, and letters to the editor. Furthermore, we screened articles for relevance. We didn’t include articles that merely mentioned Teach for All, but rather, a criteria was that the article had to substantially talk about TFA and/or have a developed description of the TFA teacher.
In terms of the time frame, we analyzed articles between the years 2010 and 2016. We chose to start collecting data from the year 2010 because Teach For All growth globally—in terms of the opening of new chapters—has steadily increased since 2010 and is continuing. For example, in 2010, five new Teach For All chapters opened globally, six started in 2013, and five started in 2015 (http://teachforall.org/en/our-network-and-impact/network-partners). We chose 2016 as our end year since that was the year this research was conducted.

The search based on the above criteria yielded a total of 32 articles that were included in the data set. On average, we analyzed three articles from each country, with the exception of Panama and Uruguay, where we were only able to find one article that met the criteria. In the case of Panama and Uruguay, programs as Enseña por Panama and Enseña Uruguay are some of the newer chapters, founded in 2015 and 2014 respectively, so this could explain the scarcity of articles written about these programs in their national newspapers. TFA chapters that have existed for longer will most likely have more written about them than newly founded chapters. In the case of the UK, there was no scarcity of articles. As mentioned above, Teach First was founded in 2002 and was the first global chapter to be created after the original Teach for America (Teach First, 2015). On the other hand, since the search included only major mainstream newspapers, it is very much possible that reporting on Teach for All in some contexts has been through different forms of media (radio, local media, blogs, alternative sources of media) but those were outside of the scope of the sample. Below is a table that lists the newspapers we analyzed for each country:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Media source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>La Nación, El Clarín</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>Sydney Morning Herald, The Age, and The Australian Financial Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>La Tercera, El Mercurio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>El Espectador, El Tiempo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>Milenio, El Diario, El Popular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>The New Zealand Herald, The Northern Advocate (of the New Zealand Herald), Otago Daily Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>La Prensa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>Perú 21, La República, El Comercio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>El Público, El Mundo, El País</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>Financial Times, The Independent, the Telegraph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uruguay</td>
<td>El Observador</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Characterization Analysis

In the examination of the characterization of the TFA teacher, we analyzed each article looking for descriptions of the three narrative elements, noting setting of each account, characters involved and the plot or actions that took place. Since the focus was on characterization of the TFA character, we read through each article separately and coded the descriptions of the TFA character in each one. We paid particular attention to recurring characters, the ways they were described, noting the adjectives and phrases that were used to describe them, the tone in which each character was revealed, and suggestive moral evaluations of characters’ actions and motives.

We examined how the teacher-character was revealed to the readers, through alterm"  
characterization, auto-characterization, as well as explicit and implicit characterization (Jahn, 2005; Yumansky, 2008). Following Jahn (2005), explicit vs. implicit characterization refers to the way in which personality traits are attributed to the character. For example, they can be attributed directly in words, or are they can be implied by somebody's behaviors. In terms of alterm-characterization and auto-characterization (also called self-characterization), alterm-characterization is when a protagonist is described by secondary characters or the narrator and auto-characterization is when the protagonist or character describes himself/herself.

Both types of characterization are present in the media narratives we analyze in this piece. For example, the TFA teachers (both current and alumni) speak about themselves and readers come to know the character through their own words, usually through the character’s quoted testimony in an article. The TFA self-characterization or auto-characterization is important because it represents the character’s own testimony and illustrates how social and cultural meanings around teaching and education are expressed at an individual level. In addition, in the various media narratives, journalists, students, school principals, politicians, government officials, chapter founders or business executives help to construct the characterization of the TFA teacher character, as they either explicitly or implicitly (by their actions) relate to, refer to and speak about how they see and perceive the TFA teacher.

Before moving on to the analysis of the characterization of the TFA teacher in more detail, we first take some time to outline two other narrative features that are present in the media stories we analyzed: the setting and the notion of a problem (also referred to as peripeteia) that serves as the impetus for the creation of a narrative (Bruner, 2002). We provide a discussion of these other narrative elements so as to facilitate an understanding for why and how the TFA character emerges and to make sense of the media stories in general. As Bruner (2002) explains, “.... everybody agrees that a story begins with some breach in the expected state of things – Aristotle's peripeteia. Something goes awry, otherwise there’s nothing to tell about” (p. 17). These two elements allow us as researchers to see and interpret how the various elements of the stories and the character’s portrayal fit together to form a coherent narrative. Furthermore, they allow us to better understand how the media stories relate to the larger context of the global education reform movement and the narratives that its proponents circulate.

Setting: The marginalized school. The setting can be understood as “the environment which situates objects and characters; more specifically, the environment in which characters move or live in.” (Jahn, 2005, section N.6.2. Para. 1). In our case, the setting in which the narratives are developed are schools that are described by the narrators or other characters speaking, as schools in poor, marginalized areas. In some countries, the schools are located in inner cities, and in others, the schools are located in remote, rural areas. These settings are important and necessary for the narrative to develop as it does in each media article; they enable the possibility for the TFA character to emerge and act in the specific context in which he/she
appears. Some examples from our data that illustrate the setting can be seen in the following excerpts:

- “Teach First was launched in 2002 and was designed to improve the quality of teaching in the inner cities” (Garner, 2010, para. 7)
- The school was located in the middle of the banana crops; it was hot as hell … It took only one week in the classroom to know that this (teaching experience) was his whole life: working for Colombian education from the most remote regions of the national territory (Betancur, 2015, para. 1-3, author's translation, emphasis in the original)
- This NGO (TFA) calls for young graduates of all university courses and invites them to teach for two years in schools located in vulnerable areas … The teachers of Enseñá por Argentina are working in 46 schools that are at an “educational disadvantage”, totalling 4,920 students. (Dillon, Bar & Gorostiaga, 2013, para. 2-4, author's translation, emphasis in the original)
- When she reached the mountains of Teziutlán, in her shoulder a backpack with all the materials: markers, projector, notebooks, books and computer lessons prepared to teach English in the village school of Cofradía, located more than two hours of the city of Puebla (Estrada, 2014, para. 1, author's translation)

The solution: The emergence of the TFA teacher. The media narratives we analyzed in this piece also present a solution to the problem that was identified and the TFA character emerges as the agent to carry out the task to arrive at the solution. As Bruner (2002) reminds us, “...we know that narrative in all its forms is a dialectic between what was expected and what came to pass” (p. 15). In other words, stories reflect expectations and the perceived problems of reality; things are not going as they are expected to go (the problem) and we use stories to offer a way out, to provide an option. This is the resolution or outcome of a narrative. From a critical perspective, we also emphasize that these solutions or preferred outcomes are thought up in situations that are sites of struggle, where oppression, dominance and hegemony of certain privileged groups in society influence which stories and which solutions are circulated and legitimized. In the case of the narratives we analyzed, the solutions that are circulated in the media articles appear to echo the Teach for All mantra of “shared problems, shared solutions” (Ahmann, 2015), which is a key component in the narratives told by the global corporate education reform movement that seeks solutions in market-based approaches to education. As the following examples show, the TFA character or the TFA chapter is introduced as a response to the problem previously mentioned in the setting.

- Improve and raise the quality of the teachers to the top. This is the point of departure around which the government, businesspeople, and civil society should act if they really want to improve the primary education system of the country (Cuevas, 2014, para. 1, author's translation).
- “Our priority is to deliver robust standards and high quality teaching to all, whatever their background. To do this we must attract highly talented people into education” (Kirkup, 2010, para. 6).
- “an innovative way to attract highly-skilled people into the job” (a quote by Teaching Profession Minister Peter Hall) (Hosking, 2013, para. 8).
The premise upon which the project is born is that of bringing “talent to education.” (Universitarios se capacitan para cubrir vacantes en Secundaria, 2014, para. 3, author’s translation)

Its aims include recruiting top graduates to bring knowledge, energy and leadership into the classroom, and to build a network of teachers committed to addressing educational inequality (de Graaf, 2015, para. 13)

In summary, according to the narratives analyzed in this piece, the lack of quality in education is the problem that justifies the emergence of programs such as Teach for All and the Teach for All teacher as a character who possesses the skills or abilities to solve the problem. In the next section, this paper explores in detail the media’s characterization of the TFA teacher character.

Characterization of the Teach for All (TFA) Teacher

As we mentioned above, character analysis can be directed towards exploring explicit and/or implicit ways in which characters are revealed in a story. To start, we analyze explicit descriptions, which are statements that clearly assign a trait or attribute to a character (Jahn, 2005).

Character Traits and Attributes

Bright, young and high performing. In the case of the media narratives, one of the first traits that is mentioned is that the TFA teacher is a high-performing, bright, young, recent graduate from an elite university in his/her home country or from elite universities abroad. In some cases, the recruit could be a young professional as well, working in a non-education related field. Consider the following headlines from the media articles:

- More top graduates to teach in tough schools: More high-performing graduates from elite universities will be recruited as teachers in the poorest areas of the country, ministers will announce today” (Kirkup, 2010, emphasis added).
- “An NGO recruits young professionals to teach in needy schools for two years” (Samela, 2012, author's translation, emphasis added)
- “Teach for Australia program lures bright sparks to teaching” (Hosking, 2013, emphasis added)
- Teach for Australia fastracks new breed in classrooms (Tovey, 2013, emphasis added)
- “A foundation will capture brilliant university graduates for teaching” (Una fundación captará universitarios brillantes para la docencia, 2011, author’s translation, emphasis added)

Teaching not his/her first choice. Moving past the headlines and into the articles, the narratives continue to develop the explicit characterization of the TFA teacher by presenting and highlighting how many of the recruited graduates do not typically possess prior background in pedagogy or teaching. Rather, they often come from the sciences, engineering, economics or business. As the stories suggest, although education is most often not a first career option, they are drawn to teaching for a variety of motives. Many of the recruits are presented as joining for altruistic reasons but, at the same time, they are also seeking to enhance their curriculum vitae.
For example, in the following media narratives the journalists describe this aspect of the character:

- “For a young engineer, economist, or accountant, the teaching profession usually isn’t the first job choice… indeed, generally, teaching is not on the horizon that they have projected as a career; in all cases, it’s usually a plan B.” (Dillo n, Bar & Gorostiaga, 2013, para. 1, author’s translation, emphasis added)
- She had two options at the end of 2009: apply for a doctorate or teach class in a vulnerable school, recruited by Enseña Chile (Pavez, 2011, para. 1., author’s translation, emphasis added)
- They’re from backgrounds a varied as mechanical engineering, veterinary sciences, business administration, art curating, economics, or humanities....” (Samela, 2012, para. 1, author’s translation, emphasis added)
- Luis Rivas is another young man who is not a teacher by profession but a communicator of the Catholic University and teaches a course on verbal reasoning. (Leon, 2014, para. 6., author’s translation, emphasis added)

Teaching as a stepping stone towards something more. The TFA character’s academic and professional background helps to solidify connections to major corporations and build a successful career in business and/or government upon finishing their TFA assignments. Moreover, the portrayal of the character suggests or implies that teaching could be understood as a stepping stone towards something more. In other words, teaching is presented as something to do on the way to stepping into other sorts of professions or taking their lives in a different direction in the future, but not usually a permanent career choice. Consider the following excerpts as examples:

- Gunal Youssouf, 23, is a Teach Firser who has joined the UK arm of PwC’s management consultancy graduate scheme. She says the two-year programme gave her a chance to taste teaching without the cost of studying for a traditional qualification (Jacobs, 2015, para. 22)
- The idea, at the very least, is that it [the TFA teaching opportunity] develops leadership and communication skills which will help to ease their way to a high-flying job in industry. (Garner, 2010, para 3.)
- …above all, the program allows them to develop professional skills valued in the job market: capacity for leadership and motivation, adaptability to tough situations, dedication, effort and creativity to resolve unforeseen situations. (Samela, 2012, para. 4, author's translation)
- Although in their way participants will develop pedagogical and managerial capacities and commitment with education either if they continue in the teaching profession or if they dedicate their time to other related to politics, business or banking. (Una fundación captará universitarios brillantes para la docencia, 2011, para. 2, author’s translation)
- “... For example, there are those who do the program and later they have the opportunity to access other benefits, like working as a teacher in another country” (Ortiz, 2016, para. 10-11. Author's’ translation)

Resourceful and motivated. By describing particular actions or behaviors of the characters, the journalists characterize the TFA teacher as possessing and demonstrating
extraordinary abilities to deal with difficult situations and limited resources and successfully lead their classrooms despite the many challenges they face. For example, the TFA teacher is creative and innovative. He/she can be extraordinarily resourceful and will “make do” with inadequate resources. Furthermore, it is common to find that leadership is a key attribute that TFA teachers generally possess, which corroborates with other studies on Teach for All and the attributes of its core members (La Londe, Brewer & Lubienski, 2015; Straubhaar & Gottfried, 2014). For example, consider the following excerpts found in our data:

- “In many schools we don’t have materials or textbooks to work but with the chalkboard and creativity, that’s enough” (Betancur, 2015, para. 7, authors’ translation, emphasis added).
- The abilities that we appreciate in them are: social vocation, willingness to teach and to learn, leadership and communication abilities, and also critical and reflexive thinking. (Saralegui, 2013, para. 6, authors’ translation, emphasis added)
- … they (TFA chapter) are looking for leadership characteristics: "people who set big goals for themselves and meet them despite the challenges and obstacles,"... (Dodd, 2015, emphasis added)
- They are youth that give it all, they interact, they question, they motivate, they are able to incentivize (Universitarios se capacitan para cubrir vacantes en Secundaria, 2014, para. 7, author’s translation, emphasis added)
- Many find that there is a background of domestic violence or poor nutrition in their students. There the young leader’s mission is to motivate students and raise their self-esteem. (Malaga, 2010, para. 7, authors’ translation, emphasis added)

Resilient, perseverant and dedicated. In addition to leadership and resourcefulness, the stories portray TFA teachers as capable of handling difficult situations with an unbreakable spirit. The character goes through difficult situations as well and his/her bravery is tested. Often, many of the narratives suggest that, at least at the beginning of a TFA teacher’s experiences, the character feels shock and fear. The TFA teacher is thus presented as a character who is able to overcome their own fears and limits and defy expectations for themselves and their students. They never give up; they show perseverance and dedication. This ultimately results in them uplifting their students, helping them to reach their goals. In the narratives we analyzed, the way that the journalists most often reveal these particular character traits is through auto-characterization, whereby the TFA teacher himself/herself is speaking. Thus, we found that the individuals who play the role of TFA teacher demonstrate a certain degree of internalization of these personality attributes and describe themselves along similar lines. See the following examples:

- “It’s a positive experience, challenging and frustrating at times. One comes into it with a lot of energy and it appears to him/her that from one day to the next, everything is going to change and when reality hits, you realize that it’s much more difficult than you thought. But the question is to never give up and keep pushing” (Dillon, Bar & Gorostiaga, 2013, para. 6, emphasis in the original, author’s translation, emphasis in the original)
- The path was not easy: students in 6th year pregnant, fights between students during civic demonstrations, lack of motivation are just some of the obstacles that
they must get through . . . (Muñoz & Reyes, 2010, para. 2., author’s translation, emphasis added)

- **We need to be patience, and persevere.** One thing is to see that reality (student’s reality) from the outside, in the TV, for example, and other is to have to live with the problems these kids have day by day. (Saralegui, 2013, para. 8, authors’ translation, emphasis added)
- "I just thought ‘Oh my god . . . how am I going to be able to help all these students? I do not think I can do this two-year program, I don't think I'm going to last at this school." (Tovey, 2013, emphasis added).

**Is able to sacrifice him/herself for a good cause.** Not only is the TFA teacher presented as internalizing the attributes of perseverance and unwavering dedication, they also internalize the idea that their choice to be a TFA teacher is one of personal and economic sacrifice; through a display of renouncing privilege to help for a good cause and the search to feel personal fulfillment in what they do, teachers explained why they joined the program. In other words, they trade economic and material privileges to become a teacher. These testimonies serve to glorify or exalt the character’s ethical commitment in order to either provoke the reader’s empathy or admiration. See the following excerpts as examples:

- “**Why would one accept a salary of a school teacher** in place of applying to a job at the Inter-American Development Bank or in a private company where your degree from the University of the Andes would permit you the opportunity of earning a dream salary of millions of dollars?” (Cuevas, 2014, para. 6, authors’ translation).
- “I got to thinking ‘Is this it?’ I was starting to wonder what I was getting out of bed for...I traded in my nice car and got rid of Sky TV, much to the irritation of my children...Now instead of a bottle of shampoo, my focus is a child's life” (Jacobs, 2015, para. 29 - 31, emphasis added)
- “When I finished my career I started looking for jobs in companies, my first job was in a consulting firm. But working there I realized that something was missing on my life. I was doing things with numbers all the time and I missed the human part. So I started to look for alternatives, and the possibility to be part of Enseñá por Argentina appeared”. (Dillon, Bar & Gorostiaga, 2013, para 5, author's translation, emphasis in the original)
- Its founder (TFA’s), Wendy Kopp, made a risky proposal: that young professional will add up to a project thought to provoke true change in society, and also that they will be **willing to become teachers rather than taking more lucrative job opportunities**.” (Gutierrez, 2012, para. 11, author’s translation, emphasis added).

**Internalization of managerial values.** The TFA teacher is characterized as a particular type of teacher, who embodies a neoliberal subjectivity and demonstrates the internalization of new managerial values. The TFA teacher is the one who is presented as able to make a difference, reverse the circumstances and change the course of events, helping and motivating students to achieve their goals. In the analysis of the narratives, we found that the characterization of the TFA teacher becomes a symbol of what good teaching looks like. The TFA teacher is presented as the archetype model of a “good teacher”. The following excerpts
present various ways in which the TFA teacher becomes a role model, and how more broadly the teacher’s role is re-conceptualized and understood within the current global educational climate.

- “...what is required of a good teacher is the same that one looks for in a good manager” (Pavez, 2011, para. 4, authors’ translation, emphasis added).
- They show the desire of the new generation of young people who believe that it is worth betting on projects that can make a difference. (Jóvenes apuestan por la educación con emprendimientos sociales, 2014, para. 4, emphasis added)
- “Teach Firsters” are highly-desirable for recruiters, says Claire Burton, head of corporate responsibility at the UK arm of Deloitte, the accountant and consultant, because they are good at working in teams and are strong leaders… Another positive of the scheme is that it encourages professional flexibility, preparing the young for the career zigging and zagging that might be necessary in the modern world of work. (Jacobs, 2015, para. 19 and para. 21).
- Enseña Chile selects professionals based on the following eight criteria: including, leadership, perseverance, and the ability to organize and reach goals. The training process for the recruits is based on the model “teaching is leading…” (Chileno fue premiado como emprendedor social del año por el Foro Económico Mundial, 2011, para. 3, emphasis added)

Stories contain expectations of how reality should be. In this sense, the ideas of what a good teacher is or how they should act can be understood as expectations that are socially and culturally constructed within the current culture of corporate-style management, whereby the application of private sector logic—emphasizing entrepreneurialism, innovation and outcomes—has come to dominate how society thinks and acts regarding education. Furthermore, these ideas play a role in reforming educational institutions and identities according to the logic of the private sector and corporate style management (Anderson & Cohen, 2015; Ball, 2012).

The focus on the ideal type of teacher present in the media narratives and represented as the archetype of good teaching is best understood within the theoretical framework known as new public management (Anderson, 2015). Behind the notion of the new public management is the idea that education can be equated to other sectors in the market; education is conceptualized as service that is delivered to users, clients or customers (Anderson, 2015). To ensure quality control, production processes are increasingly standardized and tied to measurable outcomes; this results in the work of teachers being increasingly controlled. The internalization of the corporate management ethos has lead one of the teachers from Enseña Chile to define good teaching as a matter of good management, as shown in our data. Furthermore, an entrepreneurial approach to teaching based on outcomes is reinforced as one of the excerpts above presents the TFA character as able to identify and “bet on projects that can make a difference”. The new professionalism is also marked by an ability to be a “strong leader” in ways that are appreciated by leaders within the corporate sector, as the quote from Jacobs (2015) indicates. Moreover, the TFA teachers are encouraged to be flexible and accept increasingly precarious work opportunities, euphemistically stated as “professional flexibility”, as quoted above. Exhibiting acceptance of increasing precarity in work, along with being resourceful and able to organize and reach goals in the face of limited resources, are central hallmarks to the entrepreneurial subject within the new professionalism. We discuss the implications of the new professionalism in the discussion section.
Interaction of TFA Character with Other Characters

Character analysis, in addition to examining personal traits that a character embodies, also includes analyzing how, narratively speaking, characters interact with other characters in a story. In the media stories we examine, we argue that the TFA teacher is cast as the protagonist and the students are cast in a supporting role as subjects upon which the protagonist acts. Furthermore, the protagonist TFA teacher interacts in most of the articles in an antagonistic way with traditional certified or veteran teachers (Some exceptions can be found in Barcala 2011; Iglesias, 2014; Málaga, 2010; Ortiz, 2016; Samela, 2012; where the relationship is either represented as more complex given the context in each country, or the relationship implies a degree of support, recognition and respect). In the next paragraphs we further develop the characterization of the TFA teacher through examining how the journalists construct their relationships with students and other teachers.

Student as supporting character. As we mentioned, students are supporting characters who help the protagonists develop in their roles. We found that the narratives present students as non-empowered members of society, since they are described as characters who are dependent on institutions or teachers to successfully achieve their goals and realize their potential. In other words, they can be understood as the victims of the circumstances of poverty, inequality and poor quality teaching. The students are cast as needing to be empowered and motivated by the TFA teacher, who embodies a particular type of teacher who is able to make a difference and reverse the circumstances in which their students are living. In other words, it is the TFA teacher’s arrival and his/her work in the schools that changes the course of events in the story. The TFA teacher gives his/her students opportunities, motivates them, helps them to see beyond their current state and offers them the possibility to have a better future. Consider the following quotes:

- “They prepare and train us to motivate students, to never underestimate them and to know that they can achieve the same as other people with other opportunities” (Samela, 2012, para. 9, author’s translation, emphasis added)
- “But luckily, after a year of experience, I think that now I am on the path towards being a teacher that can bring his students to achieve the goals that they want” (Dillon, Bar & Gorostiaga, 2013, para. 6, author’s translation, emphasis added)
- There is an architect in Chile, ”says David, settling into his chair,” who spent two years in this program, and as soon as he finishes he initiated a project to build schools from his experience. And there you can see how he makes children see another role for the education system (Molina, 2015, para. 12, emphasis added)

Traditionally certified teacher as antagonist. Whereas the teacher’s relation with students is presented as a relation between supporting characters and protagonist, the relationships between the TFA teachers and veteran teachers or traditionally certified teachers is characterized as a relationship between a main character and a foil character. According to Jahn (2005), “foil characters are the ones who help to highlight certain features of a major character, usually through contrast” (Section N.7.8.). In many of the articles, the relationship between veteran and TFA teachers is a relationship of either explicit or subtle/soft contrast that can also be understood as antagonism, which becomes apparent through the opinions and testimony of different voices in the narrative. This was not universal across our data, however, and in a few
articles, the TFA teachers were presented as supporting or working alongside veteran or traditionally certified teachers in a non-antagonistic way (see for example Samela, 2012, Ortiz 2016, or Malaga 2010). Nevertheless, there was still a noticeable antagonism in most of the articles. The articles that employed rather explicit antagonism were less than the number of articles that employed implicit antagonism. Below are examples of the ways in which explicit antagonism was found in the narratives:

- "I'd rather have a good teacher for two or three years than have a mediocre teacher for 10," Grier said. (Mellon, 2014, para. 24, emphasis added)
- What good does it do to do a good job with the kids, only so that in the next class, they have a teacher that does a poor job? (Muñoz & Reyes, 2010, para. 2, emphasis added)

In both of these examples, the veteran and traditionally certified teachers are presented in opposition. Furthermore, in the first excerpt, the fact that TFA teachers are required to stay in the classroom for only two years is justified and used as a way to make an explicitly antagonistic reference to veteran teachers who are labeled as mediocre. The second excerpt assumes that other, non-TFA teachers, are not doing a good job teaching and taken further, can be used as a way to justify the expansion of TFA in a particular school, region, or country, as the TFA teachers are the ones who are presented as doing a good job. However, in most of the cases in the media narratives, the journalists or teachers do not explicitly reference the antagonistic relation between the TFA character and traditionally certified teachers. Rather, they employ a variety of discursive techniques to suggest and imply doubt in veteran teachers’ teaching ability. The reader is left to make the final connection. The following excerpts illustrate this point:

- “Our priority is to deliver robust standards and high quality teaching to all, whatever their background. To do this we must attract highly talented people into education, because the quality of teachers has a greater influence on children's achievement than any other aspect of their education” (Kirkup, 2010, para. 5, emphasis added).
- … principals are welcoming it as a way of getting high-calibre graduates into schools without their having to spend another year at university...It was a positive step to get non-traditional teachers in the door (Shuttleworth, 2012, para. 3 and para. 12, emphasis added).
- David, wearing a tie, quiet and with an admirable professionalism, explains that the "greatest impact of this program (TFA) is changing the lives of many people; of young people who had never had the opportunity to have a person who not only impart them class, but who will be specialized in training them and to be perseverant. (Molina, 2015, para. 5, authors' translation, emphasis added)

To demonstrate the implicit antagonism found in many of the articles, we analyze two examples in more detail. In the Kirkup (2010) article, the testimony by Mr. Gove (who was the former education secretary in the UK) employs phrases such as “attract highly talented people into education”, which suggests that highly talented people are not part of the current teaching staff in the country (if so, there would be no need to attract a particular kind of “new”, “different” or “better” type of teacher). The other example that helps to illustrate our point is the excerpt from Muñoz and Reyes, which is more explicit in its blame on veteran and traditionally certified teachers.
The assumption is that the majority of teachers do not teach well and that the few that do are *Enseña Chile* teachers. Furthermore, the author reinforced this idea through the use of statistics, claiming “the self-esteem of students with teachers from *Enseña Chile* is 9.1% superior than the ones who did not receive intervention. The same happened with self-efficacy, where they have 5.8% more…” (Munoz & Reyes, 2012, para. 7). The journalist’s use of statistics to argue the effectiveness of the TFA teacher over traditionally certified teachers reinforces the widespread notion that “objective” measurements and statistics communicate what is important or valuable (Mathison, 2004, p. 165).

**Conflicts and Controversial Contexts: Challenges to TFA**

Although we found that there were major consistencies in the narratives’ portrayal of the TFA teacher character as the ones described above, we also found that some stories presented a slightly different narrative. While the main characteristics of the TFA characterization remain fairly similar, the substantive differences we found were mainly contextual (differences in the environment setting of the story) or in the general framing of the story.

In New Zealand and Spain, we found that some media narratives acknowledge a degree of controversy in the implementation of the TFA program in each country. For example, in Shuttleworth (2012) the headline reads “A controversial new teaching programme is seeking to ‘fast-track’ new graduates into classrooms in as little as six weeks” (Shuttleworth, 2012, par.1). This recognition of the controversial nature of TFA program differs from other countries where TFA chapters and its members are presented as undoubtedly noble, welcomed, and widely supported. A similar situation we found in the data collected from the narratives in Spain, where all three accounts from El Pais, El Mundo and El Publico that were collected in the data, emphasized the conflict between teacher unions and those who support Empieza por Educar (the name of the chapter in Spain). In the context of Spain’s current economic crisis, as well as the strength of the teachers’ union, the media articles we analyzed presented their narrative in a way that put the program’s controversial nature at the forefront. For example, in El Mundo, the teachers’ union in Basque Country is presented as denouncing the program’s implementation and in El Pais the journalist mentions that the program in its North American version “has recently raised love and hate” among the public. There was a similar situation in Chile. However, the media source that contained this rather controversial narrative about the Chilean chapter was excluded from the main data set because it was not a nationally circulating printed newspaper. This story mentions a dispute among members of the Chilean TFA chapter and the city government officials at Recoleta in Chile, because the later decided to end the relationship with the organization since they considered to be in detriment of the public education system in the region.

In the media articles we analyzed for the US, *Teach for America* is portrayed as facing important challenges, as one *Washington Post* heading reads, “Big trouble at Teach For America?” (Strauss, 2016). The US media narratives analyzed in this piece focus on two key issues that *Teach for America* faces: its lack of diversity in its teaching body and issues with teacher retention after the two-year commitment. These have been points of wide critique around *Teach for America* as is evident in the growing body of critical scholarship on the organization (see Brewer, & de Marrais, 2015; de Marrais, Wenner, & Lewis, 2013; Kavanagh, & Dunn, 2013; Kovaes, & Slate-Young, 2013; Pitzer, 2010; Torre Veltri, 2013; Vazquez-Heilig & Jez, 2010, 2014, for critiques). However, although there were controversies in the media articles we analyzed, they do not greatly affect the overall, general stance of how the media characterizes the *Teach for All* teacher. In other words, the controversies do not negate the existence of a coherent narrative around how the media describe, portray and represent TFA teachers. These controversies are more context-based and they do not represent an entirely separate character portrait.
Discussion

The media narratives analyzed in this study presented a generally consistent and coherent description of the TFA teacher, which we have illustrated above. As we demonstrate, the TFA teacher embodies and internalizes corporate managerial values that have come to typify what it means to be a good teacher within the larger corporate education reform narrative. We also illustrate how the media articles employ narrative strategies to present an antagonistic relationship between traditionally certified veteran teachers and TFA teachers. The TFA teacher is described as highly talented and high performing, resourceful, resilient and perseverant with an unwavering dedication to their students’ education. The media narratively creates an antagonism between the TFA teacher and traditionally certified teachers as a strategy that serves to emphasize the abilities and impact of the TFA teacher at the expense of veteran teachers. In addition, this characterization serves to reinforce a negative image of any teachers who are not mirroring or embodying the ideal characteristics of the TFA teachers.

Furthermore, the idealization of the TFA teacher character and the media’s focus on teacher quality result in attention being focused on creating and multiplying particular types of teachers and alternative teacher certification programs instead of asking and advancing deeper, more meaningful questions and educative policies that address the root causes of educational inequality. For example, the media narratives’ treatment of the TFA teachers’ special and exceptional traits and attributes that make them “ideal”, diverts the public’s attention away from asking questions such as: Why do teachers have to manage with limited resources in the first place? It steers attention away from conversations about adequate and equitable state funding of public schooling and puts the focus and responsibility on the individual teacher to, instead, be resourceful and innovative (in ways acknowledged and valued within a corporate framework of productivity and results based on outcomes). In other words, as Vellanki (2014) argues, “when we reduce the crisis in education to the crisis of teachers, what we are essentially doing is divorcing education from the social milieu” (p.29). Doing so disregards the reality that schools are connected to a broader social, political, economic and cultural context (Vellanki, 2014).

As we have shown, the ideal type of teacher that is presented in the media narratives is a certain type of standardized teacher that exhibits the traits and attributes of the type of teacher that is highly valued by the private sector. As Anderson (2015) explaining the notion of new public management in the public sector argues, “In the private sector, entrepreneurs want to recruit the best employees so they can outperform their competitors” (Anderson, 2015, p. 6). In education, and in the articles we analyze, this notion is present and reproduced. For instance, the principles and policy makers want to recruit the TFA teachers so that they can outperform other schools and school systems internationally (on international standardized exams like PISA). Within this context, teachers must adapt and achieve results in environments that are increasingly precarious and competitive, since educational funding is increasingly decreased or provided in competitive formats (as in the case of Race to the Top in the US).

This, therefore, creates a new type of teacher identity that is competitive rather than collaborative, whereby “social trust and public capacity-building are eroded” (Anderson, 2015, p.5). Furthermore, the focus on outcome and achievement means that the role of teaching becomes entirely subsumed within a logic to constantly perform. As Vellanki (2014) argues,

In a globalized world, we find that the control over the teacher rises under the thin veneer of ‘management pedagogies’... The advent of standardized curriculum, standardized testing and trend of ‘best practices’ has meant that the role of the
teacher is reduced to a ‘performer’ whose behavior must be controlled and made predictable (p. 29).

Such an approach results in constant surveillance and judging, whereby teachers, students, and schools are constantly evaluated knowing that the results are high stakes. Teaching in this climate can increase stress and anxiety and psychological overload due to the need to constantly perform and raise student achievement (based on limited metrics) as well as gather resources that are not publicly funded.

As the logic of the corporate world is increasingly accepted as the way in which education should be reformed, the nature and purpose of teaching are reconceptualized globally according to the logic of corporate education reform and the rise of new public management. In this study, we have attempted to provide a small contribution to understanding how this is taking place through our analysis of mainstream media articles from various countries. More research on the global network of *Teach for All* is needed to provide a more complete understanding of how this organizational network plays a role in the acceptance and growth of corporate reforms globally and the transformation of teacher identities within those reforms.

**Acknowledgement:** The authors would like to thank the editors and the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments on earlier drafts. We would also like to thank Dr. Wayne Ross and Dr. Sandra Mathison for their conceptual guidance and thoughtful feedback. Any shortcomings are our own.

**References**

http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01619560709336538


http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2010.521261.


http://dx.doi.org/10.14507/epaa.v23.1784

http://dx.doi.org/10.14507/epaa.v23.2086

http://dx.doi.org/10.14507/epaa.v23.2222


http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/448619


Appendix

Argentina

Australia

Chile

Colombia


**Mexico**


**New Zealand**


**Panama**


**Perú**


Spain

United Kingdom

Uruguay

United States
About the Authors

Michelle Gautreaux
University of British Columbia
michelletgautreaux@gmail.com
Michelle Gautreaux is a PhD student at the University of British Columbia. Her research interests include social movements, critical pedagogy, and the politics of global corporate education reform. Her primary research explores collective resistance to corporate education reform in Chicago, IL. Her work has been published in *Workplace: A Journal for Academic Labor* and *Critical Education*.

Sandra Delgado
University of British Columbia
sandra.delgado@alumni.ubc.ca
Sandra Delgado is a Ph.D. student in the Department of Curriculum and Pedagogy at the University of British Columbia. Her interests include social movements, critical pedagogy, curriculum studies, academic capitalism and academic freedom. Her articles have been published in *Workplace: A Journal for Academic Labor* and *Revista Iber: Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales, Geografía e Historia*.