Angeli dos Santos, Acácia Aparecida; Luciane de Oliveira, Katya; de Brito Cunha, Neide; Camargo Osés, Paula Cristina
Effectiveness of an Intervention Program for Linguistics Skill Development
Universidade de São Paulo
Ribeirão Preto, Brasil

Available in: http://www.redalyc.org/articulo.oa?id=305452670005
Effectiveness of an Intervention Program for Linguistics Skill Development

Acácia Aparecida Angeli dos Santos
Universidade São Francisco, Campinas-SP, Brazil

Katya Luciane de Oliveira
Universidade Estadual de Londrina, Londrina-PR, Brazil

Paula Cristina
Camargo Osés
Universidade São Francisco, Campinas-SP, Brazil

Abstract: The importance of language and its formal instruction during the initial school phase has stimulated studies that seek options to implement them successfully. From this perspective, this study aimed to verify the effects of an intervention program on the language skills assessed. The participants were sixth-grade elementary school students evaluated in reading comprehension, spelling, word recognition, and metatextual awareness. The intervention program was performed with 103 students, divided into experimental (EG) and control (CG) groups. The experimental group attended 10 sessions, which included the use of gradual Cloze technique in texts of various textual genres, which were intended to develop the reading comprehension and the development of metatextual awareness. Analyses indicated the superiority of EG over the CG in the post-test. New studies are needed to permit the generalization of the results.

Keywords: Cloze test, reading comprehension, word recognition, metalanguage

Eficácia de um Programa de Intervenção para o Desenvolvimento de Habilidades Linguísticas

Neide de Brito Cunha
Universidade do Vale do Sapucaí, Pouso Alegre-MG, Brazil

Eficacia de un Programa de Intervención para el Desarrollo de Habilidades Lingüísticas

Neide de Brito Cunha
Universidade do Vale do Sapucaí, Pouso Alegre-MG, Brazil

Palavras-chave: teste de Cloze, compreensão da leitura, reconhecimento de palavras, metalinguagem

Keywords: Cloze test, reading comprehension, word recognition, metalanguage

The study of the relation between written language and linguistic awareness or metalanguage, that is, thinking about language, is linked to metacognition, frequently discussed by authors in Cognitive Psychology, such as Flavell, P.H. Miller and S.A. Miller (1999) and Sternberg (2008), among others. Metalinguistic activities are conscious skills of the subject to deliberately maintain the monitoring and reflection about language (Maluf, Zanella, & Pagnez, 2006; Salles & Correa, 2014). Metalanguage is subdivided into subtypes, classified by Gombert (2003) according to the different aspects of the language the individual focuses on: the phoneme in phono-
logical awareness, the word in morphological awareness, the syntax in syntactical awareness, the text in metatextual awareness, and the context in pragmatic awareness.

In this study, the development of metatextual awareness will be focused on, considered as the capacity to analyze a text while maintaining intentional monitoring. When analyzing the text, if individuals are able to distinguish among different parts, assessing their degree of relevance and thematic coherence, they will be able to better understand the information the text contains (Spinillo & Simões, 2003). In comparison with other meta-linguistic skills, such as phonological and morphosyntactic awareness, the relation between metatextual awareness and reading has been hardly explored, strengthening the importance of its discussion in this study.

Pedraza (2014) observes that the studies on the assessment of reading and other related skills are intended to understand how they function and how to diagnose possible difficulties, in the acquisition as well as in the development process. That explains the experts’ interest in assessing these skills at all education levels, including not only the two phases of Basic Education, but also Higher Education (Alcará & Santos, 2015; V.L.O. Cunha, Silva, & Capellini, 2012; Gomes & Boruchovitch, 2009; Spinillo, Mota, & Correa, 2010). This is one of these studies, aiming not only to assess relevant skills for reading comprehension and for the development of word writing at the start of the 2nd cycle of elementary education, but also to verify the possibility they improve them through a program developed in a natural situation, in the classroom. It should be clarified that the choice of this cycle is justified, because it is when the students substantially increase the contact with new contents, expanding the knowledge to support the subsequent cycle, that is, secondary education (Sousa, 2007).

For authors like Suehiro and Santos (2012), research on the constructs focused on has appointed the existence of a relation between the understanding of reading and writing. They have also shown the relation between the understanding of reading and school performance, which highlights the importance of investing in intervention programs (Joly & Piovezan, 2012; Oliveira, Boruchovitch, & Santos, 2008; Piovezan & Castro, 2008). Despite the lack of a consensus, some Brazilian studies on the theme (Joly, Bonassi, Dias, Piovezan, & Silva, 2014; Oliveira et al., 2008) confirm the findings of foreign studies (Chiu & McBride-Chang, 2006) and detect the superiority of girls. The existence of diverging results appoints the need to continue exploring this aspect in further research, which is another objective of this study.

The retrieval of literature from the Scientific Electronic Library Online - SciELO Brazil in the last five years (2010-2015), using the terms “reading” and “intervention”, permitted the identification of different Brazilian articles, in view of the specificity of the focus on aspects of the Portuguese language. A brief description of each of them follows, respecting the chronological order of the publications.

With a view to improving the readers’ understanding through the monitoring skill, Coelho and Correa (2010) employed the error detection paradigm. The participants were 62 students from the first year of secondary education, distributed between the experimental and control groups. In the pre and post-test, monitoring and reading tasks were used (Cloze test). No initial difference was found between the groups and, after the intervention, the experimental group performed significantly better than the control group on the reading and monitoring tasks, permitting the conclusion that the progress in the development of the textual understanding is related to how efficiently the adolescents monitor their reading.

The results of the application of two intervention programs are reported in Santos and Oliveira (2010). In the first, with 85 fourth-year students, as well as in the second, with 73 fourth and fifth-year (former 3rd and 4th-grade), the authors aimed to investigate the adequacy of the Cloze test to assess and develop the reading comprehension. In both, the participants were distributed in experimental and control groups and, as an intervention, the gradual Cloze technique was applied, with a gradually increasing level of difficulty. The analyses indicated the superiority of the EG over the CG in the pre-test situation of the intervention only in the second program, which was expanded in terms of number of sessions. The results indicated the efficacy of the technique as an intervention instrument.

To analyze the therapeutic results based on the introduction of textual genres, Schneider, Souza and Deuschle (2010) developed a research with five subjects between 10 and 13 years of age and a history of school failure and repetition, enrolled in the 6th or 7th year of primary education. The study facilitated the motivation to read and write and led not only to textual progression and cohesion, but also to the adequacy of the formal aspects of writing, such as orthography and punctuation. The program favored other reading and writing practices in the group, revealing that the students did not have any disorder, but that they were victims of inappropriate literacy practices.

The effects of a psychopedagogical intervention on the reading understanding of 5th year students from a public elementary school were assessed by Gomes and Boruchovitch (2011), randomly drawn to the experimental and control groups. The participants answered the Scale of Learning Strategies and also used Cloze tests at three moments. During seven sessions, the Experimental Group received instructions on general and specific learning strategies for reading, stimulating metacognition, motivational support and orientations to study. The authors identified progresses in reading understanding in both groups, which were more expressive in the Experimental Group.

Capellini, Oliveira and Pinheiro (2011), in turn, intended to verify the efficacy of a computer program for metaphonological remediation and reading for students with learning difficulties. The participants were 600 students from the 3rd to 5th year of elementary school, distributed in two groups of 300 students each, one with good school performance and the other with students who presented learning difficulties. The results showed a difference between the pre and post-assessment situation for the students from the group that performed well on all tests. The experimental group with difficulties performed better on the sound recognition, segmentation and phonemic manipulation tests. Through the findings, the authors highlight the gains of the students with learning difficulties submitted to the program, who developed the metaphonological skills needed to develop reading.
Also using technological resources, Joly and Piovezan (2012) assessed the Computerized Strategic Reading Program (PILE) to improve elementary students’ reading comprehension. The participants were 58 sixth to ninth-year students, 29 of whom were part of the control group (CG) and 29 of the intervention group (IG). Once again, the Cloze test was used as the pre and post-test. The program was developed during six weeks, during which 19 meetings were held. The authors detected significant improvements in the reading comprehension levels for both groups and considered that the PILE contributed to this increase.

Machado and Capellini (2014) developed another intervention study to compare the reading and writing performance of 15 children from the second to sixth year of elementary school who had been diagnosed with developmental dyslexia, being 75% male. They were divided in an experimental group and a control group, being paired according to gender and age range. The children were submitted to a diagnostic survey of reading and writing and to the tutorial intervention program based on the Intervention Response Model. The results revealed statistically significant differences between the groups. The experimental group performed better on the word reading and reading tasks when compared to the control group. The authors concluded that the intervention model used was effective for use with dyslexic children.

In view of the expectation that, at the end of formal secondary education, the students would present a satisfactory reading level, but aware that this is not exactly what happens, Macedo, Santos, Oliveira and Martins-Reis (2015) developed an intervention research to investigate the efficacy of a Speech Therapy Program for the Promotion of Literacy (PFPL) to improve the reading comprehension. Therefore, they selected two fourth-year class groups from the first cycle of Elementary Education at a municipal public school in Belo Horizonte. The program included different types of reading activities and phonological and orthographic processing tasks. As a result, the authors identified that the groups performed similarly on the initial assessment, with a high prevalence of children with reading comprehension difficulties. After participating in the PFPL, the reading comprehension performance of the children in the experimental group significantly improved in relation to the control group, showing that the program was effective for the reading comprehension.

The different programs retrieved here share the use of diversified strategies, several of which used the Cloze technique and other resources to improve the reading. In many of them, particularly the studies developed with larger groups of students, the results reached were not as expressive in quantitative terms, but all of them appointed the existence of qualitative improvements and particularly of a motivational attitude that is more favorable to the reading activities. The described studies evidence that different linguistic skills are related to the improvement of reading and writing, but that none was focused on the metatextual awareness, an important skill in this educational phase and on which disagreements exist in terms of the potential contribution to the reading comprehension, in line with Spinillo et al. (2010).

As both the programs that employed the Cloze and those that used other intervention approaches promoted reading performance improvements, this study departs from the premise that formal activity experiences to improve the metatextual awareness can maximize the development of reading and word writing in sixth-year elementary students, when they are already expected to possess the basic knowledge. Thus, we intended to assess the efficacy of an intervention program in a classroom situation, using the Cloze technique in combination with the recognition of text genres. In addition, the students’ performance will be compared, considering the gender variable.

Method

Participants

The research started with 162 children from five different sixth-year classes, being 36 students from class A, 33 from class B, 31 from class C, 31 from class D and 31 from class E. Nevertheless, considering the students who participated in the pre and post-test and in at least seven intervention sessions, only 96 students remained. Classes A and E composed the experimental group (EG) with 47 students (minimum age = 10; maximum = 12; \( M = 11.04 \); \( SD = .735 \)), being 70.8% male \((n = 32)\) and 29.2% female \((n = 15)\). Classes B and C constituted the control group (CG) with 49 students (minimum age = 10; maximum = 12; \( M = 10.94 \); \( SD = .604 \)), being 46.9% male \((n = 23)\) and 53.1% female \((n = 26)\). It should be highlighted that both groups come from a single public school in the interior of the State of São Paulo, without any preliminary reason for distinction in terms of the skills focused on.

Instruments

Cloze texts ‘The princess and the ghost’ and ‘A happy vengeance’. The stories were structured according to the Cloze technique, which consists in the suppression of some words from the text, replaced by a dotted line proportional to the size of the word omitted (Taylor, 1953). After the initial reading, the respondents are asked to complete the blanks with the words that best complete the meaning of the text. These texts were especially elaborated for use with elementary-school children. In the correction, one point is attributed to every correct answer, adopting the verbatim correction, according to which only the words equal to those taken from the original text and correctly written (spelling and accentuation) are scored. Studies have demonstrated evidence of validity and precision estimates in both stories (N.B. Cunha & Santos, 2009; Santos & Oliveira, 2010).

Writing Assessment Scale – EAVE (Sisto, 2005). The scale consists of a list of 55 words to be dictated to the children without repetition. The students should write the words on a blank sheet of paper. In the correction, one point is attributed to every word the child writes correctly, while absent words or with spelling and accentuation errors are considered as wrong. Each student’s score corresponds to the sum of the errors, with a maximum score of 55 points. Studies have appointed the existence of validity evidence (N.B. Cunha & Santos, 2010) and good estimated precision concerning the
reproduction of written words.

Word Recognition Scale – EREP (Sisto, 2006). This is a multiple-choice scale with 55 words, organized in alphabetical order. For each of them, two other words with grammatical errors were created. Only one of the three alternatives is correct. The list contains monosyllabic, two-syllabic and polysyllabic words, with and without writing difficulties, as explained by Kingsesi and Sisto (2004). Each student’s score corresponds to the sum of the correct answers, with a maximum score of 55 points.

In studies developed with the instrument, validity evidence was identified, the most relevant being the criterion validity (N.B. Cunha & Santos, 2010), considering that it is sensitive to the distinction of statistically significant differences concerning the recognition of words among the school years. In addition, appropriate precision patterns have been identified.

Metatextual Awareness Assessments Questionnaire – QACM (Santos & Cunha, 2012). This instrument presents different texts in different genres, from which the student should select, among the options, the genre he considers correct, recognizing it without presenting any support. One point is attributed to each item that is marked correctly. In the version applied, the QACM consisted of 20 texts, being scored from 0 to 20 points. The authors’ study involving elementary-school students produced evidences of validity through the relation with a reading comprehension measure with which it converged. In addition, using the school years as a criterion, the instrument was sufficiently sensitive to distinguish the school level.

Procedure

Data collection. The procedure started with the students whose parents signed the Informed Consent Form. The research was developed in two phases. The instruments were applied in group in the classroom. The duration was 40 minutes, in the pretest as well as the post-test and in the intervention sessions with the experimental group.

The students in the experimental group (one took classes in the morning and the other in the afternoon) answered 19 Cloze texts in different text genres, applied two by two, with three in the third session only. The texts were taken from governmental programs (Reading and Writing and Educational Programs for Literacy Teachers - PROFA) or created or especially adapted for the research. The tests were applied twice per week and, after the application, the text genres applied that day were explained, as shown in Table 1. For the correction, the students were asked about their knowledge on the text genres, orally answering the applier’s questions. Thus, they gradually defined the particularities of each.

Table 1
Scheme of the Intervention Program Involving Metatextual Awareness and the Gradual Cloze

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sessions</th>
<th>Textual Gender</th>
<th>Gradual Cloze</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st session</td>
<td>Riddle + Joke</td>
<td>Three alternatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd session</td>
<td>Poetry + Nursery rhyme</td>
<td>Limited Cloze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd session</td>
<td>Recipe+Instructions+Game rules</td>
<td>Dotted with 1st letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th session</td>
<td>History + Comic</td>
<td>Dotted with 1st letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5th session</td>
<td>Diary + Interview</td>
<td>Dotted without 1st letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6th session</td>
<td>Letter + E-mail</td>
<td>Dotted without 1st letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7th session</td>
<td>Advertisement + News</td>
<td>Continuous line with 1st letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8th session</td>
<td>Dictionary + Invitation</td>
<td>Continuous line with 1st letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9th session</td>
<td>Review + Chronicle</td>
<td>Continuous line with 5th word</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the sequence of Table 1, the Cloze texts differed in terms of gradually inserted differences. For the first session of the intervention program, the two texts were organized with three alternative answers, presented under each blank space. In the second session, the limited Cloze technique was used, in which all words taken from the text were regrouped in random order in the part above the text. In the third and fourth sessions, the texts were arranged with a dotted line, showing the exact number of letters each of the omitted words contained, the first letter being inserted in advance. In the fifth and sixth sessions, the dotted line was maintained without inserting the first letter. In the seventh and eighth sessions, the text was structured with a continuous line proportional to that of the omitted word, displaying the first letter of the word. In the final session, the fifth word was omitted in the structure of the texts, without additional clues to complete the gaps. Af-
After closing off the intervention, the post-test was immediately applied, which involved the application of two Cloze tests, the QACM, the EAVE and the EREP. Both groups participated in the post-test, the experimental and the control group.

**Data analysis.** Parametric statistical tests were used, considering the normal distribution of the data with \( p > .005 \), obtained based on the Shapiro-Wilk test. Besides descriptive statistics, the t-test for related samples was used to compare the same participants’ results before and after the application of the intervention program. The t-test for independent samples was also used to compare the participants separated per gender, adding the analysis of Cohen’s d to verify the effect size.

**Ethical Considerations**

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cloze 1 pre-test</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8.00</td>
<td>2.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloze 2 pre-test</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5.09</td>
<td>2.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloze Total pre-test</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>13.09</td>
<td>5.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EREP pre-test</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>37.90</td>
<td>12.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAVE pre-test</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>20.66</td>
<td>12.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QACM pre-test</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>12.54</td>
<td>3.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data revealed the participants’ heterogeneity, considering that, in various tests, there were students who did not give any correct answer. It is important to recall that, on the EAVE, the 55 points correspond to the absence of correct answers, as the instrument scores errors. The comparison between the groups before the intervention showed that there were no significant differences between the classes that participated in the EG when compared to the CG.

Considering the objective of assessing the efficacy of the proposed intervention program, the t-test for dependent samples of the groups was used, comparing the results of the pre and post-tests. The obtained scores are displayed in Table 3.

As can be observed in Table 3, the comparison between...
the mean scores on the pre and post-tests in relation to the Total Cloze score showed a significant increase. The same occurred for the word recognition performance (EREP). As regards the comparison between the mean pre and post-test scores, when the writing and metatextual awareness were assessed, there was no significant difference between the pre and post-tests.

What the objective of checking for differences in relation to the gender variable is concerned, the t-test for independent samples was applied. The obtained results can be observed in Table 4.

We can observe in Table 4 that the difference between the genders showed the superiority of girls on several measures, the most expressive differences being related to the pre-test situations for the Cloze ($p < .015$) and the QACM ($p = .016$). In the post-test situation, the difference between both genders only remained significant on the Cloze test ($p = .031$). It should be highlighted that, in all measures, the girls presented a superior performance, although not statistically significant. Once again, it should be reminded that, on the EAVE, the highest score represents a worse performance, as the errors are scored.

**Discussion**

Initially, when reflecting on the studies found in the scientific literature, it can be observed that various obtained favorable results through interventions intended to improve or remedy the reading difficulties, especially in elementary-school students. In that perspective, a general analysis on the results obtained in this research suggests a positive impact of the intervention model proposed in the sample of students who participated in the experimental group.

The data revealed a significant difference between the mean scores on the pre and post-tests in terms of the Cloze results and also in the word recognition. At the end of the intervention, the experimental group performed qualitatively better than the experimental group in relation to the control group. It seems that, as the reading comprehension of the students in the experimental group improved, word recognition skills also improved. These data seem to support the idea that intervention actions focused on reading are valid and seem to have positive effects in the education process (Joly & Piovezan, 2012; Macedo et al., 2015; Machado & Ca-
The same did not happen for the writing variable, measured by the correct spelling of words, considering a study in which, using the same instruments, a correlation was identified between the reading comprehension and the writing skill (Suehiro & Santos, 2012). Another finding that caused estrangement was the fact that, when comparing the pre and post-test measures of the metatextual awareness variable, measured by the recognition of the text genre, no statistically significant difference could be identified between the two assessment times. Considering the concept by Spinillo and Simões (2003) that metatextual awareness represents the capacity to analyze the text, maintaining intentional monitoring to better understand the theme, perhaps the activities developed here have not been sufficient to achieve the development necessary for that purpose.

As the participating students demonstrated improvement in reading comprehension, a-questions are raised on their skills deficit before the intervention procedure. Thus, the results do not support the findings by Coelho and Correa (2010), which could evidence that the progress in reading comprehension is associated with the students’ capacity to monitor their reading.

Concerning the differences in the scores of the instruments used in the pre and post-test situations, the girls demonstrated a better performance than the boys. That was the case on the Cloze pretests and the QACM and also on the Cloze post-test. These data converge to previous research findings (Chiu & McBride-Chang, 2006; Joly et al., 2014) that also indicated that the girls demonstrated a better performance than boys. This result appoints that further studies are needed with the instruments employed here to investigate if the way they are structured could somehow privilege boys or girls (Item-Response Theory – Rasch Model). In this respect, Santos and Cunha (2012) suggest that studies that consider the gender variable in elementary education remain scarce, making discussions on the theme more difficult. This would promote respect for the particularities of each genre. Therefore, future research seems fundamental.

Finally, it is highlighted that the efficacy of the Cloze tests employed in the intervention proposal could be observed. Once again, as Santos and Oliveira (2010) observed in their study of elementary-school students, the Cloze is not only a diagnostic, but also an intervention resource.

It seems healthy to affirm that, when the reading comprehension difficulty is identified early, intervention actions can be devised to remedy and overcome the situation. This study demonstrates, on the one hand, how interventions using the gradual close can help to improve the children’s reading comprehension in the classroom and how easy it can be used as an educational practice resource. On the other hand, it illustrates that text genres can be recognized in a playful manner, although it is clear that more sessions are needed to repeat each of them, as they were presented only once during the entire program.

As a limitation, the fact can be mentioned that the intervention program involved students from a single school and only sixth-year students, which the school dean made available for research because of their difficulties. In addition, the simultaneous introduction of two independent variables (gradual Cloze and metatextual awareness) impeded the verification of the effect of each independently. Another limitation was the fact that the maintenance of the classes in their natural form made gender-balanced samples impossible, in view of the large number of boys in the EG when compared to the CG. New studies are needed, including the efficacy assessment of interventions to improve linguistic skills, aiming to overcome the limitations appointed here.

Despite the awareness that interventions like this cannot solve the fundamental problems in Brazilian education, it is important to show that they are low cost and easily applicable alternatives, being accessible to elementary-school teachers. Therefore, they can be of interest to the professionals working in the school context and beyond.

References


Pedraza, M. A. G. (2014). Criterios que orientan a un grupo de docentes para el desarrollo de la comprensión lectora y la competencia escrita en estudiantes de educación básica o media [Criteria for teachers to reading comprehension development and writing competition in primary and secondary education students] (Tese de mestraria). Recuperado de http://repository.ucatolica.edu.co/handle/10983/2091


_Acácia Aparecida Angeli dos Santos_ is a Full Professor at the Universidade São Francisco.

_Neide de Brito Cunha_ is a Professor at the Universidade do Vale do Sapucaí.

_Katya Luciane de Oliveira_ is a Professor at the Universidade Estadual de Londrina.

_Paula Cristina Camargo_ Osês is graduated in Psychology from the Universidade São Francisco.

Received: Aug. 16, 2015
1st Revision: Nov. 03, 2015
2nd Revision: Feb. 15, 2016
Approved: Feb. 23, 2016

How to cite this article: